## Quantum Phases of a Supersymmetric Model of Lattice Fermions

## B

## Liza Huijse <br> University of Amsterdam

QI\&CMP workshop, NUI Maynooth - Sept 16, 2009

## Collaborators and references

## UvA, Amsterdam:

## K. Schoutens

UVa, Charlottesville:
P. Fendley, J. Halverson
P. Fendley, K. Schoutens, J. de Boer, PRL (2003)
P. Fendley, K. Schoutens, PRL (2005)
L. Huijse, J. Halverson, P. Fendley, K. Schoutens, PRL (2008)
L. Huijse, K. Schoutens, arXiv:0903.0784

## Motivation

## challenge: understand quantum phases of strongly repelling lattice fermions at intermediate densities



Fermi liquid

$\downarrow$


Mott insulator
???

## Supersymmetric model for lattice fermions

## name of the game:

- lattice models for spin-less fermions tuned to be supersymmetric



## key features:

- susy implies delicate balance between kinetic and potential terms, leading to interesting ground state structure
- analytic control due to such tools as the Witten index and cohomology techniques


## Supersymmetric model for lattice fermions

## characteristics:

- quantum criticality in 1D
( $\mathrm{N}=2$ superconformal FT )
- superfrustration in 2D
(extensive ground state entropy)
- supertopological phases in 2D


## Outline

$>$ Supersymmetric quantum mechanics
$>$ The model
$>$ 1D: Quantum criticality
$>$ 2D: Superfrustration
$>$ 2D: Supertopological phases

## Supersymmetric QM: algebraic structure

susy charges $Q^{+}, Q^{-}=\left(Q^{+}\right)^{+}$and fermion number $N_{f}$ :

$$
\left(\mathrm{Q}^{+}\right)^{2}=0, \quad\left(\mathrm{Q}^{-}\right)^{2}=0, \quad\left[N_{f}, \mathrm{Q}^{ \pm}\right]= \pm \mathrm{Q}^{ \pm}
$$

Hamiltonian defined as
satisfies

$$
H=\left\{\mathrm{Q}^{+}, \mathrm{Q}^{-}\right\}
$$

$$
\left[H, \mathrm{Q}^{+}\right]=\left[H, \mathrm{Q}^{-}\right]=0, \quad\left[H, N_{f}\right]=0
$$

## Spectrum of supersymmetric QM

- $E \geq O$ for all states
- $E>O$ states are paired into doublets of the susy algebra

$$
\left\{\left|\psi>, \mathrm{Q}^{+}\right| \psi>\right\}, \quad \mathrm{Q}^{-} \mid \psi>=0
$$

- $E=O$ iff a state is a singlet under the susy algebra

$$
\mathrm{Q}^{+}\left|\psi>=\mathrm{Q}^{-}\right| \psi>=0
$$

- if $E=O$ ground state exist, supersymmetry is unbroken.


## Witten index

$$
W=\operatorname{Tr}(-1)^{N_{f}}
$$

- $E>O$ doublets $\left\{|\psi\rangle, Q^{+}|\psi\rangle\right\}$ with $N_{f}=f, N_{f}=f+1$ cancel in $W$
- only $E=O$ groundstates contribute
$\rightarrow|W|$ is lower bound on \# of ground states


## Outline

$>$ Supersymmetric quantum mechanics
$>$ The model
$>$ 1D: Quantum criticality
$>$ 2D: Superfrustration
$>$ 2D: Supertopological phases

## Susy lattice model

configurations:
lattice fermions with nearest neighbor exclusion


## Susy lattice model

configurations:
lattice fermions with nearest neighbor exclusion


## Susy lattice model

configurations:
lattice fermions with nearest neighbor exclusion


## Susy lattice model

configurations:
lattice fermions with nearest neighbor exclusion

nilpotent supercharges, respecting exclusion rule:

$$
\mathrm{Q}^{+}=\sum_{i} c_{i}^{+} \prod_{\delta}\left(1-n_{i+\delta}\right), \quad \mathrm{Q}^{-}=\left(\mathrm{Q}^{+}\right)^{+} \quad n_{i}=c_{i}^{+} c_{i}
$$

Hamiltonian: kinetic (hopping) plus potential terms

$$
H=\left\{\mathrm{Q}^{+}, \mathrm{Q}^{-}\right\}=H_{k i n}+H_{p o t}
$$

## Susy model in 1D


supercharges

$$
\mathrm{Q}^{+}=\sum_{i}\left(1-n_{i-1}\right) c_{i}^{+}\left(1-n_{i+1}\right), \quad \mathrm{Q}^{-}=\left(\mathrm{Q}^{+}\right)^{+}
$$

Hamiltonian:

$$
H=\sum_{i}\left[\left(1-n_{i-1}\right) c_{i}^{+} c_{i+1}\left(1-n_{i+2}\right)+\text { h.c. }\right]+\sum_{i} n_{i-1} n_{i+1}-2 N_{f}+L
$$

## $L=6$ model: Witten index

$$
W=\operatorname{Tr}(-1)^{N_{f}}
$$



$$
\begin{aligned}
& N_{f}=0: \quad 1 \text { state } \\
& N_{f}=1: \quad 6 \text { states } \\
N_{f} & =2: \quad 9 \text { states } \\
& N_{f}=3: \quad 2 \text { states } \\
\Rightarrow & W=1-6+9-2=2
\end{aligned}
$$

## Spectrum for $L=6$ sites



## Cohomology technique

## Lemma

Susy ground states are in 1-1 correspondence with the cohomology

$$
H_{Q, N_{f}}=\operatorname{Ker}\left[Q^{+}\right]_{N_{f}} / \operatorname{Im}\left[Q^{+}\right]_{N_{f}-1}
$$

of $Q^{+}$in the complex

$$
\ldots \xrightarrow{Q^{+}} H_{N_{f}} \xrightarrow{Q^{+}} H_{N_{f}+1} \xrightarrow{Q^{+}} \ldots
$$

## Cohomology technique

Spectral sequence technique for evaluating the cohomology:

- decompose: $Q^{+}=Q^{+}{ }_{A}+Q^{+}{ }_{B}$,
- first evaluate the cohomology $H_{B}$ of $Q^{+}{ }_{B}$,
- next evaluate the cohomology $H_{A}\left(H_{B}\right)$ of $Q^{+}{ }_{A}$

A tic-tac-toe lemma relates $H_{A}\left(H_{B}\right)$ to the full cohomology $H_{Q}$. In general, $H_{Q} \subseteq H_{A}\left(H_{B}\right)$.

## Outline

$>$ Supersymmetric quantum mechanics
$>$ The model
$>$ 1D: Quantum criticality
$>$ 2D: Superfrustration
$>$ 2D: Supertopological phases

## Quantum critical behavior 1D

- periodic chain: 2 gs for $L$ multiple of 3 , else 1 gs

- ground states at filling: $f=N_{f} / L=\frac{1}{3}$
- exactly solvable via Bethe Ansatz
- continuum limit: $\mathcal{N}=2$ SCFT with central charge $c=1$


## $N=2$ SCFT description for the chain

- finite size spectrum built from vertex operators

$$
V_{m, n}, \quad(-1)^{m+2 n}=-1, \quad h_{L, R}=\frac{3}{8}\left(m \pm \frac{2}{3} n\right)^{2}
$$

and Virasoro generators $\quad L_{-k, L}, L_{-k, R}$

- lattice model parameters $E, P$ and $N_{f}$ related to conformal dimensions $h_{L, R}$ and $U(1)$ charges $q_{L, R}$.
In particular

$$
E \propto h_{L}+h_{R}-\frac{c}{12}
$$

## Spectrum for 1D chain, $\mathrm{L}=27, \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{f}}=9$



## Spectrum for 1D chain, $\mathrm{L}=27, \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{f}}=9$



## Spectrum for 1D chain, $\mathrm{L}=27, \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{f}}=9$



## Spectrum for 1D chain, $\mathrm{L}=27, \mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{f}}=9$



## Outline

$>$ Supersymmetric quantum mechanics
$>$ The model
$>$ 1D: Quantum criticality
$>$ 2D: Superfrustration
> 2D: Supertopological phases

## Triangular lattice: Witten index

## $N \times M$ sites with periodic BC



|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 2 | 1 | -3 | -5 | 1 | 11 | 9 | -13 | -31 | -5 | -27 |
| 3 | 1 | -5 | -2 | 7 | 1 | -14 | 1 | 31 | -65 |  |
| 4 | 1 | 1 | 7 | -23 | 11 | 25 | -69 | 193 | -29 | -279 |
| 5 | 1 | 11 | 1 | 11 | 36 | -49 | 211 | -349 | 811 | -1064 |
| 6 | 1 | 9 | -14 | 25 | -49 | -102 | -13 | -415 | 1462 | -4911 |
| 7 | 1 | -13 | 1 | -69 | 211 | -13 | -797 | 3403 | -7055 | 5237 |
| 8 | 1 | -31 | 31 | 193 | -349 | -415 | 3403 | 881 | -28517 | 50849 |
| 9 | 1 | -5 | -2 | -29 | 881 | 1462 | -7055 | -28517 | 31399 | 313315 |
| 10 | 1 | 57 | -65 | -279 | -1064 | -4911 | 5237 | 50849 | 313315 | 950592 |
| 11 | 1 | 67 | 1 | 859 | 1651 | 12607 | 32418 | 159083 | 499060 | 2011307 |
| 12 | 1 | -47 | 130 | -1295 | -589 | -26006 | -152697 | -535895 | -2573258 | -3973827 |
| 13 | 1 | -181 | 1 | -77 | -1949 | 67523 | 330331 | -595373 | -10989458 | -49705161 |
| 14 | 1 | -87 | -257 | 3641 | 12611 | -139935 | -235717 | 5651377 | 4765189 | -232675057 |
| 15 | 1 | 275 | -2 | -8053 | -32664 | 272486 | -1184714 | -1867189 | 134858383 | -702709340 |

$\Rightarrow$ `superfrustration’

## Hexagonal lattice: Witten index

$N \times M$ sites with periodic BC


|  | 2 | 4 | 6 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 14 | 16 | 18 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 2 | -1 | -1 | 2 | -1 | -1 | 2 | -1 | -1 | 2 |
| 4 | 3 | 7 | 18 | 47 | 123 | 322 | 843 | 2207 | 5778 |
| 6 | -1 | -1 | 32 | -73 | 44 | 356 | -1387 | 2087 | 2435 |
| 8 | 3 | 7 | 18 | 55 | 123 | 322 | 843 | 2215 | 5778 |
| 10 | -1 | -1 | 152 | -321 | -171 | 7412 | -26496 | 10079 | 393767 |
| 12 | 3 | 7 | 156 | 1511 | 6648 | 29224 | 150069 | 1039991 | 6208815 |
| 14 | -1 | -1 | 338 | 727 | -5671 | 1850 | 183560 | -279497 | -4542907 |
| 16 | 3 | 7 | 1362 | 12183 | 31803 | 379810 | 5970107 | 55449303 | 327070578 |

[van Eerten 2005]

## Martini lattice



- extensive number of susy ground states, all at filling $1 / 4$ (one fermion per triangle)
- susy gs 1-1 with dimer coverings of hexagonal lattice
- exact result for ground state entropy

$$
\frac{S_{\mathrm{gs}}}{N}=\frac{1}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi / 3} d \theta \ln [2 \cos \theta]=0.16153 \ldots
$$

## Triangular lattice: ground states

Two results


- ground states exist in range of filling fractions

$$
\frac{1}{7} \leq \frac{N_{f}}{M N} \leq \frac{1}{5}
$$

[Jonsson 2005]

- upper bound to the number of gs on $M \times N$ sites

$$
\frac{S_{\mathrm{gs}}}{M N} \leq \frac{1}{2} \log \frac{1+\sqrt{5}}{2} \approx 0.24
$$

[Engström 2007]

Open problems

- ground state entropy in thermodynamic limit?
- nature of these ground states?


## Outline

$>$ Supersymmetric quantum mechanics
$>$ The model
$>$ 1D: Quantum criticality
$>$ 2D: Superfrustration
$>$ 2D: Supertopological phases

## Square lattice: Witten index

$N \times M$ sites with periodic BC


|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 2 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 |
| 3 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 |
| 4 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 |
| 5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | -9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 11 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | -9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 11 |
| 6 | 1 | -1 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 14 | 1 | 3 | 4 | -1 | 1 | 18 | 1 | -1 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 14 | 1 | 3 |
| 7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | -27 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 8 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 43 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 47 |
| 9 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 40 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 76 | 1 | 1 |
| 10 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 11 | -1 | 1 | 43 | 1 | 9 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 69 | 11 | 43 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 13 |
| 11 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 12 | 1 | 3 | 4 | 7 | 1 | 18 | 1 | 7 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 166 | 1 | 3 | 4 | 7 | 1 | 126 | 1 | 7 |
| 13 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | -51 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 14 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | -1 | -27 | 3 | 1 | 69 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 55 | 1 | 451 | 1 | -1 | 1 | 73 |
| 15 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | -9 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 11 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 174 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 11 |

## Square lattice: Witten index

Witten index related to rhombus tilings of the lattice


Theorem [Jonsson 2005]

$$
W_{\vec{u}, \vec{v}}=t_{\text {even }}-t_{o d d}-(-1)^{d_{-}} \theta_{d_{-}} \theta_{d_{+}}
$$

with $d_{ \pm}=\operatorname{gcd}\left(u_{1} \pm u_{2}, v_{1} \pm v_{2}\right), \theta_{3 p}=2, \theta_{3 p \pm 1}=-1$

## Square lattice: ground states

periodicities $\vec{u}, \vec{v}$

$$
v_{1}+v_{2}=3 p
$$

number of gs related to rhombus tilings of the lattice, with $N_{f}=N_{t}$



$$
\vec{u}=(m,-m)
$$



Theorem [Fendley, LH - Schoutens 2009]

$$
\# \mathrm{GS}=t_{\text {even }}+t_{\text {odd }}-(-1)^{\left(\theta_{m}+1\right) p} \theta_{d_{-}} \theta_{d_{+}}
$$

with $d_{ \pm}=\operatorname{gcd}\left(u_{1} \pm u_{2}, v_{1} \pm v_{2}\right), \theta_{3 p}=2, \theta_{3 p \pm 1}=-1$

## Square lattice: ground states

Example: square lattice 6x6

$$
\vec{u}=(6,0), \quad \vec{v}=(0,6)
$$

- 18 tilings with $N_{t}=8$

- correction term equals -4
$\Rightarrow 14$ groundstates with $N_{f}=8$, filling 2/9


## Square lattice: ground states

- \# gs grows exponentially with the linear size of the system
- zero energy ground states found at intermediate filling:

$$
\frac{N_{f}}{L} \in[1 / 5,1 / 4] \cap \mathbb{Q}
$$



## Square lattice: ground states

- \# gs grows exponentially with the linear size of the system
- zero energy ground states found at intermediate filling:

$$
\frac{N_{f}}{L} \in[1 / 5,1 / 4] \cap \mathbb{Q}
$$



## Square lattice: edge states

- for `diagonal' open boundary conditions there is a unique gs; expect that `vanished’ torus gs's form band of edge modes
- explicit evidence for critical modes from ED studies of
 various ladder geometries


## Octagon-square lattice



- $N \times M$ plaquettes with open bc : unique gs with one fermion per plaquette: `filled Landau level'
- $N \times M$ plaquettes with closed bc: $2^{M}+2^{N}-1$ gs
- gapless defects that interact through `Dirac strings’
- ...
$\Rightarrow$ `supertopological phase’


## Single plaquette

plaquette
(1gs)


## Single plaquette

plaquette
( 1 gs )


H-defect
(2 gs)


## Single plaquette

plaquette
(1 gs)


H-defect
(2 gs)


V-defect
(2 gs)


## Single plaquette

plaquette
(1 gs)

H-defect
(2 gs)


V-defect
(2 gs)
HV-defect
(3 gs)


## 1D plaquette chain (open)

open bc


## 1D plaquette chain (open)

open bc
( 1 gs )


## 1D plaquette chain (closed)

closed bc


## 1D plaquette chain (closed)

closed bc

(2 gs)

[ Maps to staggered 1D chain ]

## 1D plaquette chain (H-defect)

H-defect


## 1D plaquette chain (H-defect)

H-defect
(2 gs)


## 1D plaquette chain (V-defect)

V-defect


## 1D plaquette chain (V-defect)

V-defect
(2 gs)


00000000

## 2D lattice (open)

open bc
(1 gs)
"filled
Landau
level"


## 2D lattice (closed)

## closed bc <br> ( $2^{M}+2^{N}-1$ gs)



## 2D lattice (closed)

## closed bc <br> ( $2^{M}+2^{N}-1$ gs)



## 2D lattice (closed)

## closed bc <br> ( $2^{M}+2^{N}-1$ gs)



## 2D lattice (H-defect)

## H-defect <br> (2 gs)



## 2D lattice (V-defect)

V-defect (2 gs)



## 2D lattice (2 defects)

H-defect plus V-defect (4gs)<br>(I)



## 2D lattice (2 defects)

H-defect plus V-defect<br>(4 gs)<br>(II)



## 2D lattice (2 defects)

H-defect plus V-defect<br>(4gs)<br>(III)



## Supertopological phase?

need to understand

- gap above torus gs?

- edge modes for open system?
- topological interactions and braiding of $\mathrm{H}, \mathrm{V}$ and HV defects?
- ...


## Supersymmetric model for lattice fermions

## 1D: superconformal criticality



2D: superfrustration

2D: supertopological phases


Thank you

## Boundary twist: spectral flow

wave function picks up a phase $\exp (2 \pi / \alpha)$
as a particle hops over a "boundary"
twist: $\alpha: O \leftrightarrow 1 / 2$
"pbc $\leftrightarrow$ apbc" = "R $\leftrightarrow$ NS sector"

in SCFT: twist operator: $V_{o, a}$
$\longrightarrow$ energy is parabolic function of twist parameter

$$
\begin{gathered}
E_{\alpha}=E_{0}-\alpha Q_{0}+\alpha^{2} c / 3 \\
\text { R }: \alpha=0 \\
\text { NS : } \alpha=1 / 2
\end{gathered}
$$

## Spectral flow for 1D chain, $L=27, N_{f}=9$

Energy * L


## Spectral flow for 1D chain, $L=27, N_{f}=9$

Energy * L


## What can we learn from spectral flow?

- 3 fit parameters
- 4 unknowns:
$\mathrm{E}, \mathrm{Q}_{\mathrm{o}}, \mathrm{c}$ and $\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{F}}$
- $\rightarrow$ ratios

- for 1D chain we extract:

| numerics |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| sector $\mathrm{E} / \mathrm{c}$ $\mathrm{Q}_{\mathrm{o}} / \mathrm{c}$ <br> $\mathrm{c}^{*} \mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{F}}$   <br> R o -0.334 <br> NS -0.083 0 <br> .92   <br> R 0 0.342 <br> NS 0.254 0.675 | 0.89 |  |  |


| SCFT |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| state | E | $\mathrm{Q}_{0}$ |
| $\mathrm{~V}_{0,1 / 2}$ | o | $-1 / 3$ |
| $\mathrm{~V}_{0,0}$ | $-1 / 12$ | 0 |
| $\mathrm{~V}_{\mathrm{O},-1 / 2}$ | o | $1 / 3$ |
| $\mathrm{~V}_{0,-1}$ | $1 / 4$ | $2 / 3$ |

## Edge modes (heuristic argument)

- plane: \#gs = 1
- cylinder: \#gs $\sim 2^{\mathrm{M}}$

- torus : \#gs $\sim 2^{\mathrm{M}+\mathrm{N}}$

M


## Spectral flow for the square lattice

- square ladder
(2,0)x(0,L)
- zigzag ladder
$(2,1) x(0, L)$
GS for $v \in[1 / 5,1 / 4]$
- $(3,3) x(0, L)$
fermions can hop past each other

$(3,3)$

(o,L)


## Spectral flow results $(3,3) x(0,11), N_{f}=8$



## Spectral flow results

| $(L, 0) \times(3,3)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 18 | 4 | -0.0851 | 0.004 |
| 36 | 8 | -0.0841 | -0.002 |
| 15 | 4 | 0.0898 | 0.349 |
| 21 | 4 | 0.0850 | 0.337 |
| 24 | 5 | 0.0850 | 0.337 |
| 30 | 7 | 0.0853 | 0.338 |
| 33 | 8 | 0.0855 | 0.338 |


| $(L, 0) \times(1,2)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 9 | 2 | -0.0858 | -0.005 |
| 18 | 4 | -0.0842 | -0.002 |
| 27 | 6 | -0.0839 | -0.001 |
| 17 | 4 | 0.0844 | 0.336 |
| 26 | 6 | 0.0840 | 0.335 |
| 35 | 8 | 0.0839 | 0.335 |
| 14 | 3 | 0.2666 | 0.701 |
| 23 | 5 | 0.2458 | 0.657 |
| 32 | 7 | 0.2432 | 0.652 |


| $(L, 0) \times(0,2)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 16 | 4 | -0.0897 | -0.014 |
| 24 | 6 | -0.0889 | -0.012 |
| 32 | 8 | -0.0885 | -0.011 |
| 12 | 3 | 0.0911 | 0.350 |
| 20 | 5 | 0.0900 | 0.348 |
| 28 | 7 | 0.0894 | 0.347 |
| 14 | 4 | 0.0855 | 0.338 |
| 22 | 6 | 0.0849 | 0.337 |
| 30 | 8 | 0.0847 | 0.336 |

## Spectral flow results

| $(L, 0) \times(3,3)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 18 | 4 | -0.0851 | 0.004 |
| 36 | 8 | -0.0841 | -0.002 |
| 15 | 4 | 0.0898 | 0.349 |
| 21 | 4 | 0.0850 | 0.337 |
| 24 | 5 | 0.0850 | 0.337 |
| 30 | 7 | 0.0853 | 0.338 |
| 33 | 8 | 0.0855 | 0.338 |


| $(L, 0) \times(1,2)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 9 | 2 | -0.0858 | -0.005 |
| 18 | 4 | -0.0842 | -0.002 |
| 27 | 6 | -0.0839 | -0.001 |
| 17 | 4 | 0.0844 | 0.336 |
| 26 | 6 | 0.0840 | 0.335 |
| 35 | 8 | 0.0839 | 0.335 |
| 14 | 3 | 0.2666 | 0.701 |
| 23 | 5 | 0.2458 | 0.657 |
| 32 | 7 | 0.2432 | 0.652 |


| $(L, 0) \times(0,2)$ |  |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $N$ | $f$ | $E / c$ | $Q / c$ |
| 16 | 4 | -0.0897 | -0.014 |
| 24 | 6 | -0.0889 | -0.012 |
| 32 | 8 | -0.0885 | -0.011 |
| 12 | 3 | 0.0911 | 0.350 |
| 20 | 5 | 0.0900 | 0.348 |
| 28 | 7 | 0.0894 | 0.347 |
| 14 | 4 | 0.0855 | 0.338 |
| 22 | 6 | 0.0849 | 0.337 |
| 30 | 8 | 0.0847 | 0.336 |

minimal models in SCFT: $\quad c=\frac{3 k}{k+2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
E / c=\frac{4 l-k}{12 k} \text { and } Q_{0} / c=\frac{2 l}{3 k} \\
l=0:(-1 / 12,0), l=k / 2:(1 / 12,1 / 3), l=k:(1 / 4,2 / 3)
\end{gathered}
$$

